

Grateful I Am Not: Ingratitude and Resistance to Gratitude

James Jacobson-Maisels

Resistance to Gratitude

We celebrate the cultivation of gratitude and the recitation of the daily prayer *Modeh Ani* (“grateful I am”) is one of the many ways our tradition encourages us to cultivate gratitude. Yet in this essay I want to explore the shadow of these practices: the ingratitude that these practices have come to counter. Humans have a gratitude deficit amplified by our contemporary culture’s radical individualism. This essay aims to explore the causes of that ingratitude and to suggest, therefore, why we need the tradition to tell us to say *Modeh Ani*.

Every morning we are instructed to say *modeh ani*, “grateful I am,” upon awakening. It is a beautiful practice, one that can help to cultivate the feeling of gratitude and appreciation toward life. Genuinely feeling gratitude brings with it contentment, joy, completeness, relaxation, openness, and pleasure. Yet, why does such a practice exist? Why must we be told to express, feel, or cultivate gratitude, especially when truly experiencing it brings with it so many pleasant feelings? While it can seem shocking to admit it, we must be told because we are naturally ungrateful. When you wake up in the morning, how do you feel? I know that when I wake up, instead of feeling *modeh ani*, “grateful I am,” I often feel ingratitude—and its willing servants grumpiness, resistance, tiredness, hard-done-by-ness, and the like. Rather than opening our eyes to a new day filled with

gratitude, our mind says “grateful I am not!” I have to remind myself to open myself up to the gratitude and wonder of this morning. This is not to say that gratitude does not also naturally arise. It certainly does. And, depending on each person and personality, it arises more or less easily. But commandments of gratitude, commandments of blessing, prayer, praise, and appreciation abound in our tradition. Their very existence testifies to the gratitude deficit that is a normal part of human experience.

In our culture and time, the phenomenon of ingratitude is particularly deep and troubling. Gratitude, and the logically and emotionally attendant aspects of receptivity and dependence that it induces, are traits that are deeply at odds with the image of the autonomous individual championed by modern Western civilization, and particularly by American mythology. Indeed, this championing of autonomy and (pathological) resistance to dependence can be seen, quite worryingly, in American attitudes about gratitude, particularly among American men.¹ Indeed, a study investigating “which emotions they [the participants] most like to experience, which they most dread having, which they prefer to ‘keep in,’ and which they view as constructive and destructive” found that “Americans in general ranked gratitude comparatively low in desirability and constructiveness, and American men, in particular, tended to view the experience of gratitude as unpleasant. Some, in fact, found gratitude to be a humiliating emotion. Over one-third of American men reported a preference for concealing feelings of gratefulness.”²

Why? Why are we, in our current time and place, and particularly we men, so resistant to gratitude? What is it about the ways in which we think about ourselves and the models of being that we are given in our culture that are so at odds with gratitude and that find it so threatening? This resistance to gratitude is something I know I myself from personal experience and, if you investigate, it may be part of your experience as well. Are there times when you knew you

“should” have said thank you for something but some part of you didn’t want to? (And I certainly invite women to answer the question as well!) Why? What was producing that resistance, which may have been present for a very good reason? There are innumerable reasons why gratitude can be elusive, ranging from simple forgetfulness to an ideological opposition to the implication that we have received some gift. When asked to say grace, Bart Simpson responded, “Dear God, we paid for all of this stuff ourselves, so thanks for nothing.”³ In this essay, I will explore a particular constellation of related qualities that give rise to resistance to gratitude—indebtedness, non-ownership, dependence, humility, and vulnerability—and I will offer strategies for how to best deal with these forms of resistance to gratitude.

Gratitude and Indebtedness

This resistance to gratitude, to the feeling of indebtedness, is attested to early in our tradition. The Torah describes Israel’s ingratitude for the manna in their telling Moses “we have come to loathe this miserable food” (Numbers 21:5). The Talmud picks up on the Israelites’ resistance to demonstrating gratitude for the manna and connects it to their unwillingness to ask God to bless them with properly directed hearts, calling them “ingrates, descendants of ingrates” and indicating that the failure to ask God for help is also a symptom of ingratitude.⁴ The Tosafot there comment that the Israelites “didn’t want to ask God to give to them because they did not want to be indebted to God.”⁵ That is, the Israelites did not want to acknowledge their gift of food nor request additional aid, precisely because they did not want to feel indebted.

Indeed, one of the most obvious and fundamental qualities elicited by gratitude is a feeling of indebtedness and a desire to give back. While it can produce resistance, this very quality can make

gratitude, naturally felt and lovingly returned, such a wonderful and powerful part of building relationships of mutual giving and support. For instance, consider the discussion in *Sefer Ha-hinnukh* of the commandment to honor one's mother and father, which places this quality front and center:

Among the concepts inherent in this *mitzvah* is the fact that it is proper for an individual to acknowledge and repay with kindness those who performed kindness for him. He shall not be a vile individual who fails to recognize or to acknowledge one's kindness, for this is an utterly evil and abominable trait, in the eyes of God and man.

The individual should recognize that his father and mother brought him into this world. It is therefore incumbent upon the individual to render to them all the honor and kindness that it is possible for him to render, for they brought him into the world, and they troubled themselves greatly in his behalf during his younger years.

When the individual shall accept this trait upon himself, he will, as a result, acknowledge the kindness of the Almighty, who was the cause of his creation and that of all his ancestors until Adam, the first human, and who brought him into the light of the world, and provided for his needs all the days of his life, and who formed him, and perfected his limbs, and endowed him with a soul and with intellect and understanding. For were it not for the soul with which the Almighty blessed him, he would be devoid of understanding, like a horse or a mule. And he shall weigh in his mind how exceedingly great is his responsibility to serve his Creator.⁶

The recognition of receiving a gift—and the attendant experience of gratitude—can carry with it a feeling of indebtedness, a responsibility to give back. This doesn't have to be a heavy weight of responsibility. It can be, for example, a light joy at the opportunity to invite friends over to dinner next time.

Yet this responsibility, in many different ways, can create great resistance to the feeling of gratitude itself. We don't want the burden of indebtedness and our bodies and hearts constrict in recognition of our debts. We don't want the responsibility of giving back, whether it is hosting a friend in return or even in the most abstract sense of giving back to the world, cherishing it and taking care of it. This can feel especially true when the indebtedness is near infinite, such as the relationship to our parents or to God. How can we possibly ever repay the very gift of life?

Resistance to gratitude can be especially strong when we have negative feelings toward the gift-giver. Resentment and gratitude do not easily coexist. Allowing ourselves to feel gratitude often entails letting go of resentment and anger. It means abandoning our sense of ourselves as victims and our sense of boundless entitlement. It requires jettisoning other feelings too, some of which are very strong and difficult to abandon precisely *because*, though essentially dishonest and false, they make us feel secure and safe. Allowing ourselves to feel grateful may simply produce the simplest of obligations, the obligation to say thank you. Yet the phrase can stick in our throats because it comes into conflict with one of the attitudes or emotions delineated above. Or it can do so because, in the expressing of it, we feel ourselves explicitly in the other person's debt—and that person may be someone to whom we do not particularly wish to be indebted.

The question is: how do we let go of this resistance to indebtedness, and not just on the level of the intellect, but as the constriction we feel in our hearts and bodies? In part, that answer will come as we explore the other qualities that hinder gratitude. But for now, we can simply note that if receiving a gift implies indebtedness then, as *Sefer Ha-ḥinnukh* argues, we are all always already infinitely indebted to those who gave us life and enabled us to survive our childhood—a group that includes our parents, caretakers, teachers, crossing guards

and the like, and also God. This can feel threatening, but gratitude and indebtedness can also be an extraordinary celebration of the endless love and support we have received from moment of our birth until this day. It can open our chests and widen our throats as we laugh and shout forth the blessedness of life. The question is about how we relate to it and what picture of ourselves we carry around in inside of us.

Gratitude and Non-Ownership

A second aspect of our resistance to gratitude is the way it challenges our sense of ownership, entitlement, and desert. When we earn money for work we do, and even when we acquire money by other means (for example, by inheritance or through investments), we tend to feel that we properly own and deserve that money, that we are entitled to it due to our work, effort, intelligence, etc. To experience gratitude for that money would in some way be acknowledging that it is not properly ours, that we do not fully deserve it, that we are not genuinely entitled to it—in short, that it is a gift. Here again, gratitude can imply a level of non-ownership or non-entitlement and can, in turn, call forth obligations of generosity that can be hard to accept. For example, Rabbi Nathan Sternhartz (1780–1844), widely called Reb Noson, the leading disciple of Rabbi Naḥman of Bratzlav (1772–1810), teaches this lesson as follows:

The rich person should judge himself and understand that God certainly does him a great favor which he is not worthy of at all and gives him abundant money and wealth while many righteous people who are thousands of times better than him, have their lives dangling before them, and they have no livelihood and there is no food or clothing in their homes, and they suffer from great need, God save us.

Certainly it is not right that I should be ungrateful to God. Certainly it is fitting for me to do God's will, for He gave me all this wealth and He can take it away or add to it according to His will. Therefore, one is certainly obligated to give God His portion, and we have been told to give His portion to the poor. For in truth everything is His. And, if a person pays careful and true attention with his heart and mind, he will well recall all these matters. And, more than this, he will give a great deal of charity, with both hands, cheerfully and with great joy. His heart will not be pained at all in his giving to a poor person. For he will understand that he does not give anything to the poor person. On the contrary, everything is God's. But God was compassionate to not impose upon him that he must give four-fifths [of his wealth to the poor] and one fifth to himself.⁷

Reb Noson here claims that this truth of non-ownership is something we all already know; we must only recall it, by paying careful attention with our heart and mind. If we do, we will recognize clearly that what we have is not ours but a gift from the Divine, and therefore its use is not a choice we ourselves make but rather an obligation that we sense when guided by the Divine. This notion of ownership is very difficult truly to embrace and accept—that is, to genuinely think and act as if what we legally own is not in any deep way ours but only a gift, a loan, from the Divine.

This conception, which challenges our sense of self-sufficiency, independence, ownership, entitlement, and desert, can feel threatening. If we adopt Reb Noson's perspective, we must necessarily always be constrained in our use of what we "have" because we never really have it. In acknowledging this, we experience a loss of control and autonomy that challenges our sense of independence, control, and hence our sense of safety as well. We can never fall into the satisfying illusion that "I did this," "I built this," or "I earned this," but must always realize that we have never all by ourselves truly

done anything at all. We must admit that the help of others—as well as the good fortune of propitious circumstance, unearned talent, and divine gifts—have all been inseparable parts of anything we have accomplished. We can never say “It’s mine, I’ll do what I want with it,” and so we must willingly abandon the comforting illusion that we are in control of our lives in the way we all would like to imagine to be the case. This conception shakes our basic assumptions about our relationship to the material world. It scares us because it requires a radical revisioning of the nature of ownership and the legitimacy of doing what we wish with our possessions.

Yet, imagine what it would feel like truly to internalize this conception of ownership. I know that it fills me with a sense of profound gratitude when I actually do embrace this way of relating to the world. And it makes me feel blessed with abundance, not denied ownership of my “things” merely because I acknowledge the true nature of ownership in the created world. If we were to take in this conception, we would experience a life-giving sense of sufficiency and blessedness rather than our often-felt neediness and fear. We would feel an openness and even a playfulness with respect to our possessions, akin to how a child acts joyously when receiving a gift. Similarly, such a conception, as Reb Noson teaches, would bring a lightness and joy to the experience of giving things away. Picture the joy of being given the wonderful job, by some charitable organization, of giving thousands of presents away to needy children. How delightful and wonderful such an experience would be! It would entail the pure joy of giving, absent any of the tightness of loss, and this is precisely what this perspective encourages.

Yet despite these gifts, we can shy away from this approach because of the way it threatens our sense of self, pride, and ego. It threatens the ways in which we think of ourselves as accomplished and worthy, the ways in which we think of success and achievement, and of course the ways in which we think of ownership. It threatens our entitlement to

what we have, as well as our security and confidence. In these ways we often develop resistance to feelings of gratitude, because of the implications we sense for what this would entail about our sense of self, in all the ways we have discussed. Letting go of this resistance therefore requires confronting these fears and loosening our sense of self and ownership. It requires us to face the insecurity of the truth of lack of control and discover a basic all-right-ness that is not tied to success or achievement. It means giving up the illusion of separateness and independence, and abandoning the belief that we have ever done anything “ourselves.” Such a process is a central part of many paths of spiritual practice and results in a reorganization of our self-conception and of how we act and express ourselves in the world.

It is extraordinarily difficult to do this, and it is also just a slow, accessible, step-by-step process. Little by little, we give up the illusion of control, we believe more deeply in our basic all-right-ness, we relinquish the tying of our self-worth to our achievement, we recognize our non-separateness from all other beings, God and the world, and we therefore embrace the interpenetrated nature of ourselves as intertwined with every other existence in this universe. As we do this, there is a lightness and openness that enters our life and relationships. There is less neediness, fear, striving, and tightness, and more trust, play, experimentation, gratitude, connection, and enough-ness. We welcome ourselves in more deeply, as we truly are, and we abide in our basic blessedness.

Gratitude, Humility, Submission and Purification

In the ways we have been discussing, gratitude is then deeply connected to humility, to loosening our sense of pride, ownership, superiority, control, etc. Indeed, the S’fat Emet (Rabbi Yehudah Aryeh Leib Alter of Ger, 1847–1905) claims: “The submission and

purification of the embodied heart in a person is gratitude.”⁸ The very nature of gratitude is submission and purification—the submission and release of the ego, and the resulting purification that is the very nature of that submission.

Let us first consider the purifying effects of gratitude. When gratitude arises, we can feel, I want to suggest, its purifying effects: the way it cleanses the heart of envy, selfishness, anger, clinging, and feelings of victimization, and brings in its stead a sense of lightness, joy, and openness. Indeed, elsewhere the S’fat Emet teaches that “Praise and thanksgiving is joy and submission.”⁹ The submission is both purification and joy, the lightness that comes with being unburdened of all the unnecessary loads that we have been lugging around with us. Perhaps we can see this most clearly in the cleansing tears that might accompany a profound feeling of gratitude, the thankfulness that might arise, for instance, upon being saved from some grave danger.

This gift of purification can be deeply longed for, but it can also be deeply feared. Giving up our anger or our sense of victimization, for instance, does not actually feel safe to many of us. We experience these emotions, such as the sense of victimization, because some part of ourselves thinks they protect us, make us strong, defend us, comfort us, or shift the blame away from us so that we can feel all right. Really opening ourselves to gratitude, then, requires a willingness to release those patterns of heart and mind that block us from experiencing our blessedness.

The experience of submission, which the S’fat Emet claims is part and parcel of gratitude, is particularly challenging in our culture, which celebrates control, autonomy, and self-sufficiency. Yet submission is an inextricable part of gratitude, because in experiencing gratitude we recognize our insufficiency and dependence. We see the ways in which we are always reliant on forces beyond ourselves, whether

other people, nature, or the Divine. There is a humility inherent in gratitude, which is the recognition that, as we discussed above, we have never done anything ourselves. Our very existence was and always is constantly dependent on forces outside of our control. The submission inherent in gratitude is perhaps just the letting go—the release and giving over—of our hard, tense efforts at control. It is acknowledging our smallness in the face of the universe.

Yet this acknowledgment of our smallness in genuine gratitude can also feel celebratory and opening. When we genuinely let go, genuinely submit, we are liberated; we are released in our releasing. It is the sweetness of prostrating ourselves on Yom Kippur, the surrendering of the self to that which is greater, and therefore the joy of no longer having to protect the self. It, in fact, contrasts with feelings of inferiority or inadequacy for which ingratitude, and the desperate attempt to maintain feelings of superiority and adequacy (success, achievement), can simply be an attempt to cover up.¹⁰ Genuine gratitude is not craven or sniveling; it is joyous and confident. When we surrender with an open heart, we do not feel inadequate or inferior, but we experience a humble majesty, that we are a thread in the tapestry of divinity.

It is particularly interesting, in the context of our discussion, that the S'fat Emet stresses the embodied heart. His suggestion invokes the felt sense of gratitude, pointing to the way that gratitude manifests itself physically as some combination of release, submission, purification, and opening. The gratitude we are discussing is not theoretical or intellectual, but rather a felt experience in the embodied heart, in our emotional and physical body. It also indicates to us the way forward, the way through these hindrances to gratitude, which is the embracing of both the feeling of gratitude and the resistance to it in the body. We work through these impediments not theoretically but by embracing the tightness and embodied resistance they produce

and, in our loving embrace, allowing them to soften and release. It is hard to explain this process to one who has never experienced it, but it is part of the fundamental work of meditation, where we bring our attention to the emotional tightness in the body itself; and through intentionality, the softening of the body, and the love and compassion of the heart and mind, we make space for and welcome that tightness in loving embrace, so that it can release and move through us.

In this discussion of hindrances to gratitude, we can now add one final quality: shame. It is an aspect I have touched on already in my discussion, but without having named it clearly. Rabbi Jonathan Eybeschütz (1690–1764), an eighteenth-century central and eastern European rabbi, teaches this lesson as follows:

In truth, this quality of being ungrateful grows from the root of pride. For one whose heart is high and mighty and mind is haughty will be ashamed to say that he received a favor from another. In his heart, he will say, “I have no need of any person and my wisdom and ‘my strength and the power of my hand’ (Deuteronomy 8:17) will do everything for me.” Therefore, he is ungrateful.¹¹

When we are caught in pride, acknowledging the aid we have received from others (whoever those others are), we can feel shameful. Our pride, supported by cultural messages, tells us that capable, grown-up persons do everything themselves out of the conviction that depending on others is somehow a sign of failure. Pride resists this acknowledgement as a way of protecting our sense of self, our sense of independence and competence.

When we feel ashamed, we can notice that some kind of “should” is present, as, for example, in the thought “I *should* have been able to do it myself, I *should* have been more self-sufficient.” In similar ways, anger (which our tradition teaches is also rooted in pride) can emerge toward ourselves for not fulfilling that “should,” for not having done

that thing or even *being* able to do it ourselves. Or in perhaps more subtle ways, we become angry, disappointed, or ashamed at ourselves for not handling some situation correctly, for not responding in the best way we could have and the way we know we should have. Yet this reaction too is grounded in the illusion of our own control, independence, and competency. We end up focusing on and belaboring our failures rather than feeling gratitude for our successes, and gratitude for all of those factors, external and internal, that have brought about those successes. It is an approach that gets caught up in how our identity is affected by success or failure, rather than simply celebrating the result itself. It is an approach rooted in pride and our own sense of successfulness. In contrast, humble people do not feel shame, because they do not hang their sense of self on their successes or failures, on praise or blame, on their actions or how they appear to others.

An approach of gratitude, an approach that is about loosening the sense of self, is grateful for what there is and entails the possibility of striving for positive change without the success or failure of that change being tied up in our own worthiness or importance. If we only care about the project itself—the positive results of whatever we are trying to do—then whether or not we are being helped by others is irrelevant and shame at accepting aid need not arise. I once heard that the Hazon Ish,¹² when asked how one can know if one is doing a *mitzvah* in the proper way, gave the example of the *mitzvah* of welcoming a guest and of preparing a guest bedroom for someone to stay in who happens to be stopping in your community. The correct way, he says, is to simply find joy in preparing the bedroom. If you later learn that the visitor has somewhere else to stay, then you should feel happy that they have reunited with a friend. But if, when they find somewhere else to stay, you are upset, then you know your fulfillment of the *mitzvah* was really caught up in your sense of self and pride.

Gratitude and Vulnerability

The shared underpinning of all of the hindrances we have been discussing is vulnerability. Ingratitude, the reluctance to accept help, and the unwillingness to acknowledge that we have been helped are all ways of protecting ourselves from some feeling or self-conception that is threatening, whether indebtedness, non-ownership, humility, dependence, or others. The Rosh, Rabbi Asher ben Yehiel (1250–1328), teaches: “Do not be ungrateful, and honor any person who creates an opening for you to request enough for your satisfaction.”¹³ Here the Rosh clearly joins these two qualities together, our unwillingness to request help as being tied into resistance to gratitude. Gratitude and requesting help both make us aware of our neediness and our vulnerability, and they both express this vulnerability and dependency to others. As Rabbi Norman Hirsh expresses it:

To be grateful is to acknowledge the threat of non-being, non-having, non-achieving, non-connecting, and non-independence; it is to look into the abyss of nothingness on which being rests and through which God gives and sustains....The blessings of life are gifts, not rights, given insecurely and impermanently to a needy being. We resist the concepts of gift, jeopardy, and need.¹⁴

It takes courage to be grateful. A grateful person must acknowledge the gift as an unrequired gift, his essential neediness as a human being, and the jeopardy of life. Because our essential gladness to be alive provides a source of gratitude, it may seem too simple or dramatic to say that to be grateful we need the courage to look into the abyss. Nevertheless, we do need a quiet, clear-sighted courage to face the human situation of gift, neediness, and jeopardy without the illusions that make us feel more secure than the human condition merits. Gratitude is a quietly courageous virtue.¹⁵

We resist gratitude because we resist acknowledging and feeling our own vulnerability, our insecurity, and our lack of control. The way forward then is precisely in acknowledging and embracing these fears.

To cultivate gratitude, we must also embrace that which resists gratitude, as we have discussed, welcoming in the tightness and fear with love and compassion. This point is crucial. To experience more gratitude in our lives, we must embrace opportunities for gratitude, consciously cultivating gratitude whenever and wherever we can. Yet there is also an important role for working with that which blocks our natural gratitude, our natural awe, and our sense of wonder in the face of life, from arising. The foundation of our work with blocks to gratitude is vulnerability, the willingness to be with and to fully experience the unpleasant and threatening feelings that arise in response to opportunities for gratitude, and the application of loving attention to those feelings without needing either to believe them or fall into them. We simply hold them, like a parent cradling a child. Perhaps when we do this we will be able to genuinely say *modeh ani*, “grateful I am,” and experience the wonder of each moment.

Each morning, as we wake up, we can commit to saying *modeh ani*, “grateful I am,” and then seeing what arises. We can commit to cultivating our gratitude, finding those places that we feel natural gratitude toward, and giving gratitude the space and opportunity to do its healing work. We can also commit to be lovingly present with our blockages, by which I mean those places in which we do *not* naturally or easily want to experience gratitude. And we can commit allowing our blockages *also* to be held in love and respect and so, in turn, allowing that gratitude which is lurking underneath to emerge. Then we can say the *Modeh Ani* again, perhaps this time being able to believe a bit more deeply in our gratitude and in our blessedness, seeing and celebrating the gifts we have been given, and opening ourselves to the wonder and joy that come in gratitude’s wake.

NOTES

¹ Pathological in the sense that independence is seen as a supreme value that displaces other crucial values (such as compassion) and is, moreover, illusory—as there never has been and never will be a completely independent human being, if only for the simple reason that no human beings have ever brought themselves into the world.

² Robert Emmons, *Thanks!: How Practicing Gratitude Can Make You Happier* (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2008), p. 130, citing Corinne Kosmitzki and Shula Sommers's essay, "Emotion and Social Context: An American-German Comparison," in *British Journal of Social Psychology* 27(1988), pp. 35–49. Emmons's work has in general been highly influential on my thoughts about gratitude and his thinking permeates this essay.

³ Quoted in Emmons, *Thanks*, p. 8.

⁴ B. Avodah Zarah 5a.

⁵ Tosafot to B. Avodah Zarah 5a, s.v. *k'fuyei tovah*. See the discussion in Zechariah Fendel, "Gratitude and Thanksgiving," in his *The Ethical Personality: A Comprehensive Analysis of the Torah Approach to Ethics Gratitude* (New York: Hashkafah Publications, 1986), p. 242.

⁶ *Sefer Ha-hinnukh, mitzvah 27*, ed. Chaim David Chavel (Jerusalem: Mossad Harav Kook, 5720 [1959/1960]), p. 79. This translation is Zechariah Fendel's, in his "Gratitude and Thanksgiving," p. 225. *The Sefer Ha-hinnukh* is an anonymously published thirteenth-century Spanish work enumerating the commandments. The word "God" appears as "G-d" in Fendel's original.

⁷ Rabbi Nathan Sternhartz, *Sefer Likkutei Halakhot, Hoshen Mishpat, Hilkhot G'viyyat Milveh* ("Laws Relating to Collecting and Lending"), *halakhab* 3.

⁸ Sermon for Hanukkah 5644 (1883), printed in *Sefer S'fat Emet: Heilek Rishon* (ed. Petrikow, 5665 [1904/1905]), p. 109b.

⁹ Sermon for the Seventh Night of Hanukkah 5635 (1874), in *Sefer S'fat Emet: Heilek Rishon*, p.103b.

¹⁰ Cf. Emmons, *Thanks*, p. 147.

¹¹ Jonathan Eybeschütz, *Sefer Ye'arot D'vash* (Lublin: Schneidmesser and Hirschenhorn, 1897), part I, sermon no. 15, p.92 .

¹² Rabbi Avraham Yeshaya Karelitz (1878–1953) is popularly known, after the title of his magnum opus, as the Hazon Ish.

¹³ Rabbi Asher ben Yehiel, *Sefer Or'hot Hayyim* (New York: Mesivta Publication Society, 5703 [1942/1943]), "Customs for Fridays," p. 5a.

¹⁴ Norman Hirsh, "Gratitude: The Quiet Courage," *Journal of Reform Judaism* 34:2 (1987), p. 60.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 57.